

DOI: 10.21767/2471-8513.100023

Dissecting SLE Heterogeneity with Sub Phenotype Mapping

Yogita Ghodke-Puranik* and Timothy B Niewold**

Division of Rheumatology, Department of Immunology, Mayo Clinic, Rochester, Minnesota, USA

Corresponding author: *Yogita Ghodke-Puranik, Division of Rheumatology, Department of Immunology, Mayo Clinic, 200 1st St.SW, Guggenheim Bldg. 3-19, Rochester, MN 55905, USA, Tel: 507- 266-5228; Fax: 507-266-0981; E-mail: Ghodke.Yogita@mayo.edu

**Timothy B. Niewold, Division of Rheumatology, Department of Immunology, Mayo Clinic, 200 1st St. SW, Guggenheim Bldg. 3-42, Rochester, MN 55905; Phone: 507- 284-8450; Fax: 507 284 0564; Email: Niewold.Timothy@mayo.edu

Received date: September 06, 2016; **Accepted date:** September 12, 2016; **Published date:** September 19, 2016

Citation: Ghodke-Puranik Y, Niewold TB (2016) Dissecting SLE Heterogeneity with Sub Phenotype Mapping. J Autoimmune Disord 2: 3. doi: 10.21767/2471-8513.1000e3

Copyright: © 2016 Ghodke-Puranik Y,, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Description

Systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE) is a complex, multifactorial autoimmune disorder in which environmental factors cooperate with multiple genetic variants in disease pathogenesis. It is a highly heterogeneous condition, characterized by differences in autoantibody profile, serum cytokines, and diverse clinical manifestations, making it difficult to predict the spectrum of organ-system involvement and long-term outcomes in an individual patient. It is evident from familial aggregation and monozygotic twin studies that SLE has a strong genetic component [1]. Recent advances in human genetic studies have advanced our knowledge of the immunopathogenesis and have explained some of the genetic basis of SLE [1,2]. Various candidate gene studies, genome wide association studies (GWAS) and large scale replication studies of SLE in different ancestral backgrounds have been successful in identifying more than 60 genetic risk factors and emphasizing their important role in SLE susceptibility [3]. However, they were able to explain relatively little of the heritability of this complex trait, accounting for far less than half of the heritability of SLE [2,4-7], and most of the variants identified through these studies have modest overall effect sizes (odds ratio (OR) ~1.2 to 1.5) [2,3].

There is a large degree of phenotypic and genetic heterogeneity in SLE makes it challenging to define the heritability of this disease. Different genetic variations and molecular pathways might have varying consequences in different patients. It is possible that some genetic associations are unique to a particular group of SLE patients based on the fact that certain genetic factors will be linked to specific disease phenotypes and pathogenic pathways [8-10]. We suspect this between-patient heterogeneity in the molecular pathogenesis of SLE is a key factor in the unexplained heritability of the disease to date. This heterogeneity among patients greatly reduces the power of overall case-control studies in SLE, and is a probable explanation for much of the “missing heritability” in this disease [11]. We suggest that it is

feasible to directly study the genetic heterogeneity in SLE by designing studies focusing on pathogenic molecular subphenotypes. If these phenotypes truly represent differences in the root causes of the disease, then this method would greatly increase our power to detect novel pathogenic loci. Our recent SLE case-case GWAS study using the pathogenic molecular sub-phenotype interferon-alpha (IFN- α) is a good example of utilizing the sub-phenotype mapping strategy to identify additional important pathogenic SLE-associated genes which otherwise may be missed with standard case-control analyses [11].

IFN- α is a type I interferon with the potential to break self-tolerance by activating antigen-presenting cells [12], and is central to the pathogenesis of SLE. Circulating serum IFN- α levels are higher in SLE patients [13] and this IFN pathway activation is heritable within SLE families [14]. Case-control genetic studies in SLE have demonstrated remarkable overrepresentation of a number of genes involved in type I IFN signalling, production and response [2]. We have subsequently demonstrated that many SLE risk genetic polymorphisms contribute to high IFN levels in SLE patients [15,16] supporting the idea that gain-of-function polymorphisms in the IFN pathway are a common pathogenic mechanism in SLE. Previous work from our group has also shown that some of the established SLE-risk loci are characterized by strong subphenotype effects, which are much greater than the overall case-control effect size [2,17]. For example, >70% of the risk of SLE related to the IRF5 gene is found in a specific subset of patients defined by an autoantibody profile [17]. IRF5 is one of the strongest overall risk factors for SLE, suggesting that heterogeneity in genetic association may be a common phenomenon. To address heterogeneity directly and identify additional novel genetic factors associated with IFN pathway dysregulation in SLE, we performed a GWAS comparing high IFN SLE patients to low IFN SLE patients. This case-case subphenotype mapping strategy allowed us to detect genetic influences on serum IFN- α in SLE, thus identifying novel pathogenic SLE-associated genes which may not be detectable

with standard case-control studies. We studied over 1800 SLE cases from different ancestry using this approach and were able to identify a novel association between several new loci with high serum IFN (PMeta-analysis $< \times 10^{-10}$). The top loci in our study have not been previously reported in other case-control studies of SLE, and were not top loci in the initial case-control analysis of the GWAS dataset we used in this study, supporting the potential of this approach to define new genes linked to SLE pathogenesis.

In an additional study, a similar case-case sub phenotype mapping approach was used to detect genetic factors associated with autoantibody profiles and serum IFN- α in moderate-sized well-characterized SLE cohort [18]. SLE-associated autoantibodies (anti-RBP and anti dsDNA) are another important heritable sub-phenotype in SLE that plays a pathogenic role in disease initiation [14,19]. In this study, a case-case GWAS was performed by stratifying patients with extremes of high vs. low interferon and presence vs. absence of autoantibodies, and this study design identified a number of novel genetic regions that are associated with high IFN- α and particular autoantibodies in SLE patients [18]. These genetic associations were very strong and specific to the particular patient groups and were not as strong in the overall cohort, again suggesting that this trait stratified approach was essential to discover these genes. These studies support the idea that distinct genetic associations underlie the heterogeneity of molecular pathogenesis in SLE. Apart from GWAS studies, sub phenotype mapping strategy has also been employed to compare peripheral blood gene expression between AA (African American) and EA (European American) SLE patients stratified by the presence or absence of anti-RBP antibodies [20]. In this study, the sub phenotyping approach helped to discover heterogeneity in the activation of molecular pathways between ancestral groups based on the presence of particular autoantibodies.

More recently the concept of subphenotyping has been applied to study SLE-associated renal disease, known as lupus nephritis (LN). LN is a common and severe complication of SLE that can advance to end-stage renal disease (ESRD), leading to an increased burden of morbidity and mortality [21]. Despite the discovery of numerous overall SLE susceptibility genes, only a small subset of these genes is associated with susceptibility to LN [22]. Additionally, the magnitude of the effect size (OR) for overall SLE susceptibility genes as risk factors for LN is much lower than their impact upon SLE in general indicating their broad impact more on SLE than their impact upon LN alone. To address this question, studies have examined the LN phenotype directly by comparing SLE patients that have LN to those without LN. This disease sub phenotyping strategy aided in discovering new genes with renal functions that specifically linked to LN but has not been discovered in overall case-control studies of SLE [23-25].

The above studies all support the idea that the sub phenotype mapping strategy can be an efficient method to identify novel genetic variants associated with SLE that are not readily apparent in case-control designs. In fact, these studies suggest that SLE is characterized by a complexity in genetic

architecture that will require molecular sub phenotyping to fully delineate. Secondly, this approach can help to characterize the molecular heterogeneity in SLE immune pathway activation that may be clinically important, such as IFN-pathway activation. This pathway is currently being targeted therapeutically, and heterogeneity in patient response may be tied at least in part to genetic heterogeneity in type I IFN pathway. The next major frontier is in understanding the molecular and immunologic significance of the genetic variations that are associated with SLE, as this type of knowledge will allow us to personalize treatment.

Funding

Y Ghodke-Puranik – none, TB Niewold – Research grants from the NIH (AR060861, AR057781, AR065964, AI071651), Rheumatology Research Foundation, CureJM Foundation, the Mayo Clinic Foundation, and the Lupus Foundation of Minnesota.

References

- Ghodke-Puranik Y, Niewold TB (2015) Immunogenetics of systemic lupus erythematosus: A comprehensive review. *J Autoimmun* 64:125-136.
- Ghodke-Puranik Y, Niewold TB (2013) Genetics of the Type I Interferon Pathway in Systemic Lupus Erythematosus. *Int J Clin Rheumatol* In Press, 2013.
- Teruel M, Alarcon-Riquelme ME (2016) The genetic basis of systemic lupus erythematosus: What are the risk factors and what have we learned. *J Autoimmun*.
- Graham RR, Kozyrev SV, Baechler EC, Reddy MV, Plenge RM, et al. (2006) A common haplotype of interferon regulatory factor 5 (IRF5) regulates splicing and expression and is associated with increased risk of systemic lupus erythematosus. *Nat Genet* 38: 550-555.
- Harley JB, Alarcon-Riquelme ME, Criswell LA, Jacob CO, Kimberly RP, et al. (2008) Genome-wide association scan in women with systemic lupus erythematosus identifies susceptibility variants in ITGAM, PXX, KIAA1542 and other loci. *Nat Genet* 40: 204-210.
- Remmers EF, Plenge RM, Lee AT, Graham RR, Hom G, et al. (2007) STAT4 and the risk of rheumatoid arthritis and systemic lupus erythematosus. *N Engl J Med* 357: 977-986.
- Gateva V, Sandling JK, Hom G, Taylor KE, Chung SA, et al. (2009) A large-scale replication study identifies TNIP1, PRDM1, JAZF1, UHRF1BP1 and IL10 as risk loci for systemic lupus erythematosus. *Nat Genet* 41: 1228-1233.
- Harley JB, Kelly JA, Kaufman KM (2006) Unraveling the genetics of systemic lupus erythematosus. *Springer Semin Immunopathol* 28: 119-1130.
- Kim K, Brown EE, Choi CB, Alarcon-Riquelme ME, Kelly JA, et al. (2012) Variation in the ICAM1-ICAM4-ICAM5 locus is associated with systemic lupus erythematosus susceptibility in multiple ancestries. *Ann Rheum Dis* 71: 1809-1814.
- Rullo OJ, Woo JM, Wu H, Hoftman AD, Maranian P, et al. (2010) Association of IRF5 polymorphisms with activation of the interferon alpha pathway. *Ann Rheum Dis* 69: 611-617.

11. Kariuki SN, Ghodke-Puranik Y, Dorschner JM, Chrabot BS, Kelly JA, et al. (2015) Genetic analysis of the pathogenic molecular sub phenotype interferon-alpha identifies multiple novel loci involved in systemic lupus erythematosus. *Genes Immun* 16:15-23.
12. Blanco P, Palucka AK, Gill M, Pascual V, Banchereau J (2001) Induction of dendritic cell differentiation by IFN-alpha in systemic lupus erythematosus. *Science* 294: 1540-1543.
13. Hooks JJ, Moutsopoulos HM, Geis SA, Stahl NI, Decker JL, et al. (1979) Immune interferon in the circulation of patients with autoimmune disease. *N Engl J Med* 301: 5-8.
14. Niewold TB, Hua J, Lehman TJ, Harley JB, Crow MK (2007) High serum IFN-alpha activity is a heritable risk factor for systemic lupus erythematosus. *Genes Immun* 8: 492-502.
15. Kariuki SN, Kirou KA, MacDermott EJ, Barillas-Arias L, Crow MK, et al. (2009) Cutting edge: autoimmune disease risk variant of STAT4 confers increased sensitivity to IFN-alpha in lupus patients in vivo. *J Immunol* 182: 34-38.
16. Niewold TB, Kelly JA, Flesch MH, Espinoza LR, Harley JB, et al. (2008) Association of the IRF5 risk haplotype with high serum interferon-alpha activity in systemic lupus erythematosus patients. *Arthritis Rheum* 58: 2481-2487.
17. Niewold TB, Kelly JA, Kariuki SN, Franek BS, Kumar AA, et al. (2012) IRF5 haplotypes demonstrate diverse serological associations which predict serum interferon alpha activity and explain the majority of the genetic association with systemic lupus erythematosus. *Ann Rheum Dis* 71: 463-468.
18. Kariuki SN, Franek BS, Kumar AA, Arrington J, Mikolaitis RA, et al. (2010) Trait-stratified genome-wide association study identifies novel and diverse genetic associations with serologic and cytokine phenotypes in systemic lupus erythematosus. *Arthritis Res Ther* 12: R151.
19. Ramos PS, Kelly JA, Gray-McGuire C, Bruner GR, Leiran AN, et al. (2006) Familial aggregation and linkage analysis of autoantibody traits in pedigrees multiplex for systemic lupus erythematosus. *Genes Immun* 7: 417-432.
20. Ko K, Koldobskaya Y, Rosenzweig E, Niewold TB (2013) Activation of the Interferon Pathway is Dependent Upon Autoantibodies in African-American SLE Patients, but Not in European-American SLE Patients. *Front Immunol* 4: 309.
21. Hanly JG, O'Keeffe AG, Su L, Urowitz MB, Romero-Diaz J, et al. (2016) The frequency and outcome of lupus nephritis: results from an international inception cohort study. *Rheumatology (Oxford)* 55: 252-262.
22. Mohan C, Putterman C (2015) Genetics and pathogenesis of systemic lupus erythematosus and lupus nephritis. *Nat Rev Nephrol* 11: 329-341.
23. Genovese G, Friedman DJ, Ross MD, Lecordier L, Uzureau P, et al. (2010) Association of trypanolytic ApoL1 variants with kidney disease in African Americans. *Science* 329: 841-845.
24. Freedman BI, Langefeld CD, Andringa KK, Croker JA, Williams AH, et al. (2014) End-stage renal disease in African Americans with lupus nephritis is associated with APOL1. *Arthritis Rheumatol* 66: 390-396.
25. Chung SA, Brown EE, Williams AH, Ramos PS, Berthier CC, et al. (2014) Lupus nephritis susceptibility loci in women with systemic lupus erythematosus. *J Am Soc Nephrol* 25: 2859-2870.